Rebuttal Reply

David Klaftenegger
< david.klaftenegger@it.uu.se >
Stavros Aronis < stavros.aronis@it.uu.se >

Department of Computer Systems
Uppsala University

January 28, 2013
Context

Story

- group of authors
- paper submitted
- theoretical and experimental part
- approximation of theoretical approach
- rebuttal: approximation of exact method compared to theory?
Context

Story

- Authors: discovered implementation error after submission
- Due to this, results not as good as theoretical approach
- But fixable before publication

Ethical Question

- What should be answered?
- Truth over publishability?
Options

- no reply
- claim not to know about problem
- claim not to be able to reason about it yet
- claim problem is fixable before publication
- claim to already have fixed the problem
Arguments

No Reply
- concerns not addressed
- information not shared
- unprofessional

Claim Problem Unknown
- hiding information
- may not help publication
- at least there is a reply
Arguments

Claim Unable to Reason About
- aware of problem
- this is the theoretical point of view
- full solution is lacking
- not withholding knowledge
- no risks in answer: provable
## Arguments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Claim Fixable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>■ aware of problem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>■ this is the practical approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>■ full solution not yet finished</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Claim Fixed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>■ problem already solved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>■ highest chance of publication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>■ this is lying</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion

Reasonable answers
1. claim unable to reason about
2. claim fixable

Differences
- (2) shares everything authors know / think
- (1) is sceptical of own abilities
Tools

Organisation, Learning and Ethics
- applies to projects
- does not handle specific questions well
- should be used when starting a project

Heteronomy / Autonomy
- fast way of finding key aspects
- may be sufficient
- no real help for hard decisions
Tools

Autonomous Thinking
- gathers many aspects
- hard to draw conclusion from
- possibilities/risks not always applicable

Collab
- UI could be more responsive
- easy collaboration
- choose appropriate points
- still hard to draw conclusion from
Questions?