

# Conflicts of interest in peer review

Jonas Flodin

Konstantinos Koukos

Carl Leonardsson

Aleksandar Zeljic

Johannes Åman Pohjola

Uppsala University

Department of Information Technology

October 22th, 2013





## Peer review

### Why do we need it?

- ▶ For quality control, but:
- ▶ How do we define research quality?





## Peer review

Is there a definition of research quality?

Most probably NOT! Can be some widely accepted guidelines.

- ▶ Relevance of the topic (to the conference/journal)





## Peer review

Is there a definition of research quality?

Most probably NOT! Can be some widely accepted guidelines.

- ▶ Relevance of the topic (to the conference/journal)
- ▶ Novelty of the idea





## Peer review

Is there a definition of research quality?

Most probably NOT! Can be some widely accepted guidelines.

- ▶ Relevance of the topic (to the conference/journal)
- ▶ Novelty of the idea
- ▶ Clarity





## Peer review

### Is there a definition of research quality?

Most probably NOT! Can be some widely accepted guidelines.

- ▶ Relevance of the topic (to the conference/journal)
- ▶ Novelty of the idea
- ▶ Clarity
  - ▶ How clear is the problem we are addressing?





## Peer review

### Is there a definition of research quality?

Most probably NOT! Can be some widely accepted guidelines.

- ▶ Relevance of the topic (to the conference/journal)
- ▶ Novelty of the idea
- ▶ Clarity
  - ▶ How clear is the problem we are addressing?
- ▶ Correctness/Soundness of the results.





## Peer review

### Is there a definition of research quality?

Most probably NOT! Can be some widely accepted guidelines.

- ▶ Relevance of the topic (to the conference/journal)
- ▶ Novelty of the idea
- ▶ Clarity
  - ▶ How clear is the problem we are addressing?
- ▶ Correctness/Soundness of the results.
- ▶ Specialization of the reviewer.





## Peer review

### Is there a definition of research quality?

Most probably NOT! Can be some widely accepted guidelines.

- ▶ Relevance of the topic (to the conference/journal)
- ▶ Novelty of the idea
- ▶ Clarity
  - ▶ How clear is the problem we are addressing?
- ▶ Correctness/Soundness of the results.
- ▶ Specialization of the reviewer.
  - ▶ But ...



## Peer review

### A sting in computer science...

#### **Router: A Methodology for the Typical Unification ...**

**Abstract** Many physicists would agree that, had it not been for congestion control, the evaluation of web browsers might never have occurred. In fact, few hackers worldwide would disagree with the essential unification of voice-over-IP and public/private key pair. In order to solve this riddle, we confirm that SMPs can be made stochastic, cacheable, and interposable.





## Peer review

### A sting in computer science...

#### **Router: A Methodology for the Typical Unification ...**

**Abstract** Many physicists would agree that, had it not been for congestion control, the evaluation of web browsers might never have occurred. In fact, few hackers worldwide would disagree with the essential unification of voice-over-IP and public/private key pair. In order to solve this riddle, we confirm that SMPs can be made stochastic, cacheable, and interposable.

- ▶ Joke paper





## Peer review

### A sting in computer science...

#### **Router: A Methodology for the Typical Unification ...**

**Abstract** Many physicists would agree that, had it not been for congestion control, the evaluation of web browsers might never have occurred. In fact, few hackers worldwide would disagree with the essential unification of voice-over-IP and public/private key pair. In order to solve this riddle, we confirm that SMPs can be made stochastic, cacheable, and interposable.

- ▶ Joke paper
- ▶ “Written” by a computer program



## Peer review

### A sting in computer science...

#### **Router: A Methodology for the Typical Unification ...**

**Abstract** Many physicists would agree that, had it not been for congestion control, the evaluation of web browsers might never have occurred. In fact, few hackers worldwide would disagree with the essential unification of voice-over-IP and public/private key pair. In order to solve this riddle, we confirm that SMPs can be made stochastic, cacheable, and interposable.

- ▶ Joke paper
- ▶ “Written” by a computer program
- ▶ **Accepted** to *World Multiconference on Systemics, Cybernetics and Informatics 2005!*



## Peer review

### Conflicts of interest (Questions/Discussion)

- ▶ Reviewing your friend's or foe's paper.
  - ▶ How blind are blind reviews?
- ▶ Bias for a method
  - ▶ Expertise vs objectiveness in the research area.
- ▶ Exposure for your area

