In this document we present the evaluation of the tools used by our group (7) for making a decision for a practical ethical problem. Instead of describing the problem we describe our experience with the tools and how we think they can be used.

OLE:
Identify the possibility of ethical conflicts for a given problem.

This tool is based on a simple questionnaire. We found it relatively straightforward to answer and used it to identify the possibility of ethical conflicts for our problem.

HA:
Helps to identify your own standpoint and real reason behind the decision.

The tool is used to categorize the arguments regarding the problem into autonomous and heteronomous ways of thinking. Irrespective of the final decision made, this tool helps identify the thought process for the different arguments you come up with.

It was difficult for us to differentiate between the two sub-categories (dogmatic and reflexive) in the heteronomous ways of thinking. Even though we thought very hard about the issue at hand, the difference between the two seemed very subtle.

AT:
Helps you exhaustively list all possibility and risks with regards to actions and stakeholders but not always applicable.

We used the questionnaire to exhaustively list the possible actions and all possible values/interests/principles etc. and find how they affect the consequences for the issue. The exhaustive process is both negative and positive as investigating the detailed combinations can soon become a very tedious and tiring task. On the other hand it also provides a complete overview of the possible decisions and outcomes for the issue.

ColLab:
Helps you visualize “where” the conflicts and interests overlap between the stakeholders.

ColLab is a tool similar to AT but collaborative in nature where the participants can contribute to an issue in parallel and individually. We like that we could work on the tool in parallel and therefore achieve a complete view of the issue faster. It also helps visualize the stakeholders along with their individual (and overlapping) interests and conflicts. However,
we often have conflicting ideas, and ColLab make it worse when we dont understand the meaning of each cell.